ATTACHMENT G(1)

Assessment of Heritage Significance

Edgecumbe Estate Heritage Conservation Area

STRATEGIC PLANNING

Assessment of Heritage Significance Edgecumbe Estate Heritage Conservation Area

26 May 2021





Contents

1.	Introduction	3
	1.1. Background	3
	1.2. Authorship	3
	1.3. Methodology	3
2.	Location and context	3
	2.1. Description of subject area	3
	2.1.1. Subject area	3
	2.1.2. Surrounding context	9
3.	Heritage status	11
	3.1. National Trust Register	11
	3.2. State Heritage Register, Heritage NSW, Department of Premier and Cabinet	11
	3.3. Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012	12
4.	Historical summary	12
	4.1. Early history of Coogee	12
	4.2. Historical development of Coogee	13
	4.3. Historical context of Edgecumbe Estate	17
5.	Existing character: Physical attributes and	
	alues, curtilage, setting and views and historical	
th	emes	21
	5.1. Physical attributes and values	21
	5.2. Curtilage and setting	25
	5.3. Curtilage	25
	5.4. Setting and views	26
	5.5. Historical Themes	28
6.	Assessment of Significance	29
	6.1. Assessment against Heritage Council of NSW criteria	29
	6.2. Statement of Significance	31
7.	Comparative analysis	32
8.	Conclusion	35
9.	References	36

1. Introduction

1.1. Background

A Planning Proposal to amend the Randwick Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2012 to list three dwellings (No. 39 Dudley Street, No.41 Dudley Street and No.148 Brook Street, Coogee) as heritage items, and establish the Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area was submitted to the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment for Gateway determination on 11 April 2020. The listing of the three dwellings within Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP 2012 was supported and Amendment No.7 was gazetted 10 July 2020, however, more information and justification was required before support could be given to establish the Heritage Conservation Area.

The following Assessment of Significance has been prepared by Randwick City Council in response to a request by the NSW Department of Planning, Industry and Environment (in its letter dated 7 July 2020), which requested additional information to support the creation of the Heritage Conservation Area and amend Schedule 5 of Randwick LEP accordingly.

1.2. Authorship

This report was prepared by Kate Wine, Senior Environmental Planning Officer – Heritage, Randwick City Council.

1.3. Methodology

The methodology of this document is based on the Heritage NSW (former NSW Heritage Office) guidelines within their publication for 'Assessing Heritage Significance' to formulate an assessment of cultural significance, and further guided by the principals of the ICOMOS Burra Charter 2013.

2. Location and context

2.1. Description of subject area

2.1.1. Subject area

The proposed Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area is located on the north western corner of the intersection of Dudley and Brook Street and within the wider block bounded by Mount Street, Dudley Street, Brook Street and Carr Street (see figures 1 and 2).

The area's boundary runs north along Brook Street to the intersection of Havelock Avenue where is turns to the north west and runs along the northern and western boundary of No. 142A Brook Street. It runs south along Edgecumbe Avenue and then turns west, along the rear boundaries of 37-41 Dudley Street, turning south again along the western boundary of 37 Dudley Street and running east along the Dudley Street frontage.



Figure 1: Aerial photograph showing proposed Heritage Conservation Area (red outline) within the wider context of Coogee, and the existing heritage items (brown) and existing conservation areas (red hatching). (Source: RCC)



Figure 2: Aerial photograph of the proposed Heritage Conservation Area (Edgecumbe Estate) comprising Nos. 37, 39, 41 Dudley Street, 5 Edgecumbe Avenue, and 142A, 144, 146, 148, 150, 152 Brook Street, Coogee. (Source RCC)

The area encompasses 10 properties located within the suburb of Coogee. All properties are examples of Inter-war residential development.

The properties are identified as nos. 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street which have frontages to Dudley Street, nos. 142A, 144, 146, 148, 150, 152 Brook Street fronting Brook Street, and No.5 Edgecumbe Avenue which has a primary frontage to Edgecumbe Avenue, a cul-de-sac which is accessed via Dudley Street and runs parallel and to the west of Brook Street. A pedestrian path runs between nos. 142A and 144 Brook Street in an east/west direction and allows direct access between Brook Street and Edgecumbe Avenue. Nos. 39 and 41 Dudley Street and nos. 142A, 148 and 152 Brook Street are locally listed heritage items pursuant to Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP 2012.

The description of each property to be included within the conservation area is provided in the following table. Photographs taken by Randwick City Council.

Address	Property type	Property image	Lot and DP
142A Brook Street	Residential flat building		SP13844
144 Brook Street (and 1-3 Edgecumbe Avenue)	Residential flat building		SP4898
146 Brook Street	Residential duplex		Lot 2 DP388326

Table 1: Subject properties included within the proposed Heritage Conservation Area

148 Brook Street	Single dwelling	Lot B DP305284
150 Brook Street	Single dwelling	Lot A DP305284
152 Brook Street	Residential flat building	Lot 1 DP195960
37 Dudley Street	Single dwelling	Lot A DP301192
39 Dudley Street	Single dwelling	Lot B DP301192

41 Dudley Street	Single dwelling	Lot C DP301192
5 Edgecumbe Avenue	Single dwelling (previous duplex)	Lot 1 DP388326

The three properties fronting Dudley Street contain a continuous grouping of detached Inter-War bungalows, one-two storeys in height. The subject properties fronting Brook Street comprise a mix of two-three storey Inter-War residential flat buildings and a duplex, as well as two single storey detached bungalows. No.5 Edgecumbe Avenue is also included within the proposed area and comprises a two storey Inter-war detached dwelling (former residential flat building), with frontage to Edgecumbe Avenue and rear boundary shared with No.146 Brook Street.

Photographs of subject area



Figure 3: View of subject area looking north along Brook Street from the intersection of Brook and Dudley Streets (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 4: View of subject area looking south along Brook Street from the primary frontage of St Brigid's Catholic Church (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 5: View of subject area looking north east towards intersection of Edgecumbe Avenue and Dudley Street from the southern side of Dudley Street (Source: Randwick City Council).



Figure 6: View of subject area looking in a north easterly direction from further west along Dudley Street showing nos.37-41 Dudley Street in the foreground (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 7: View of subject area looking in a southerly direction along Edgecumbe Avenue, from its northern end (Source: Randwick City Council)

2.1.2. Surrounding context

The surrounding context is predominantly residential and characterised by a variety of lot and building sizes. It features a mix of Federation and Inter-War buildings comprising single and multi-dwelling residences, as well as some later twentieth century and contemporary development fronting Edgecumbe Avenue and further east along Dudley Street.

Immediately north of the subject area is the intersection (underpass) of Havelock Avenue and Brook Street, and a three storey mid-1980s residential apartment complex (4-8 Edgecumbe Avenue) which wraps around the northern tip and western site of Edgecumbe Avenue. To the west of the area is the 'Our Lady's Nurses of the Poor' aged care development and further to south west is the Dudley Street Heritage Conservation Area. On the opposite side of Dudley Street to the south, the land is occupied by a mix of further two-three storey residential dwellings which follow the rise of the land along Brook Street to the south and Dudley Street to the west. To the east, on the opposite side of Brook Street, are the buildings associated with St Brigid's parish, as well as two mid-late twentieth century brick residential flat buildings.



Photographs of surrounding context

Figure 8: View of medium density residential development on the western side of Brook Street to the north of the subject area. (Source: Randwick City Council).



Figure 9: View looking north along Brook Street from the intersection of Dudley Street showing medium density (mid-late) twentieth century residential development opposite the subject area, and the heritage listed St Brigid's Catholic Church roof and spire further to north east. (Source: Randwick City Council).



Figure 10: View of residential development further south along Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council).



Figure 11: View of residential development further east along Dudley Street, showing a mix of early twentieth century dwellings and contemporary infill (Source: Randwick City Council).



Figure 12: View of residential development further west along Dudley Street, opposite the southern boundary of the subject area and showing a mix of early twentieth century dwellings and contemporary infill (Source: Randwick City Council).

3. Heritage status

3.1. National Trust Register

There are no properties listed on the National Trust Register located within the subject area.

3.2. State Heritage Register, Heritage NSW, Department of Premier and Cabinet

In accordance with the Heritage Act 1977, the NSW Heritage Council administered by Heritage NSW maintains the State Heritage Register (SHR) which is a register of items and places considered to have heritage significance for the State of NSW. None of the properties located with the subject area boundary are listed on the SHR.

3.3. Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012

Five (5) out of the ten properties located within the subject area have local heritage listing pursuant to Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP 2012. These properties are shown in Figure 13 and described within the table below:



Figure 13: Extract of RLEP 2012 Heritage Map 007 showing existing local heritage items within the boundary of the proposed Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area.

Address	Item name	Item no.
142A Brook Street, Coogee	3 storey Art Deco residential flat building	171
148 Brook Street, Coogee	Inter-war bungalow	1473
152 Brook Street, Coogee	'Brooklyn Flats'	172
39 Dudley Street, Coogee	Inter-war bungalow	1471
41 Dudley Street, Coogee	Inter-war bungalow	1472

Table 2: Local heritage items within proposed Conservation Area

All the properties within the subject area are zoned R3 Medium Density Residential under Randwick LEP 2012, with a maximum height limit of 12 metres and FSR of 0.9:1. It is noted dwelling houses have an alternative applicable FSR based on a sliding scale under the RLEP.

There are no proposed changes to these existing zoning and development standards which apply to the sites located within the subject area.

4. Historical summary

4.1. Early history of Coogee

Prior to European settlement, the Bidgigal and Gadigal people lived in and around the Coogee area. The name 'Coogee' ('Koojay', koojah' or 'koo-chai') is derived from the Dhurug language meaning 'rotting seaweed' or 'place of bad smells' which can wash up on the shores of Coogee Beach and leave a distinct smell.¹

¹ Randwick City Council (2019)

The Bidjigal and Gadigal people were coastal dwelling clans and relied on the ocean and harbour for their primary food source including fish, shellfish and native figs or ferns roots². At Sources suggest that at the time of European settlement, there were approximately 1500 Aboriginal people living between Broken Bay, Wreck Bay and Botany Bay³.

4.2. Historical development of Coogee

Coogee was known as 'Great Coogee' during the early 1800s and Coogee Bay was a seaside attraction from as early as 1820. The village of Coogee was officially founded 12 October 1838 which its planned grid of intersecting streets for the settlement was registered at the New South Wales Colonial Secretary's office. The village area had been set aside in response to a number of applications by settlers wanting to secure large blocks along the Sydney coastline.



Figure 14: Village of Great Coogee [Cartographic Material]. Bemi, P. L. 1847 (State Library NSW).

The early days of European settlement, Coogee flourished as a market gardeners paradise. Many of the first residents such as Charles Catley, made their fortune growing vegetables for the Sydney markets and large mansions were being built.⁴ The completion of a road to Coogee by the 1840s, which was serviced by horse drawn buses (omnibuses), had made it much more accessible, however, by 1858 there were still only 14 homes in the area.⁵

² Randwick City Council (2019)

³ Randwick City Council (2019)

⁴ Randwick City Council

⁵ Randwick Municipal Council. (1989) p71



Figure 15: Extract of Randwick Waverley & Coogee 1859 [Cartographic Material]. Surveyor General's Office, 1859 (State Library NSW).

By the late nineteenth century large mansions had been built by wealthy Sydney residents and successful businessmen such as Charles Moore (owner of *Ballamac*, and former Mayor of Sydney 1867-1869, and Randwick alderman in the 1880s) 'who were establishing their status in society with imposing homes by the seaside'.⁶ Other residents of notable homes included John Starkey, softdrink manufacturer, and timber merchant CT Saxton.⁷ A small suburban shopping centre flourished at the bottom of Belmore Road, now known as Coogee Bay Road. Coogee Public School opened in 1876.

In 1879 Simeon Pearce, Mayor of Randwick, along with nearby municipalities petitioned for the construction of the tramways to the eastern suburbs.⁸ By 1883, a tramline (extended from Randwick) to Coogee Bay carrying steam trams was completed.⁹ Coogee Beach was the first beach in the eastern suburbs to be serviced by tram. The improved accessibility to the beach influenced both investment and development opportunities for Coogee.¹⁰

⁶ Randwick City Council

⁷ Lawrence, J (2001) p.46

⁸ Oultram, J 2018

⁹ Randwick Municipal Council (1989) p.71

¹⁰ Oultram, J 2018



Figure 16: Higinbotham, Robinson & Harrison. 1886, Randwick, Parishes of Alexandria and Botany



Figure 17: Glass plate negative, full plate, 'Coogee Bay, Sydney', Henry King, Sydney, Australia, c. 1880-1900 (Museum of Applied Arts and Science)

Coogee Aquarium and Swimming Baths were opened in December 1887 and were highly reviewed as places of leisure and entertainment for all ages and included indoor swimming bath and great hall (later roller skating rink) as well as outdoor enjoyments such as swings, rocking horses, toy boats, donkey rides, toboggan rink and slide as well as aviaries, flowerbeds and a bandstand. While the popularity in the entertainments at the Aquarium started to decline by 1908, Coogee's popularity was increasing as a destination for water-based leisure activities such as surfing¹¹.

Coogee Surf Life Saving Club was established in 1907, and in the same year, Wylie's Baths was opened by Henry Wylie at the southern end of Coogee Beach. By the 1920s, Coogee was being 1marketed as "*Australia's most Beautiful Seaside Resort*".

Assessment of Heritage Significance Edgecumbe Estate Heritage Conservation Area

¹¹ Randwick Municipal Council (1989) p.78



Figure 18: View of Coogee Beach prior to construction of Coogee Pier c.1920 - "COOGEE" (State Library NSW)

Figure 19: CR Wyle, '*Beautiful Coogee*' 1929. (State Library of NSW)

Construction of the Coogee Pier, known as the "Coogee Pleasure Pier" commenced in 1926 and it was officially opened 24 July 1928. The pier extended 183 metres into the ocean from the middle of the beach, however, its success only lasted a few years. The structure was largely destroyed in a sea storms and had to be demolished in 1933. The pier had been testament to the suburb's aspiration aspirations to become the premier seaside resort for the Sydney Region.¹²



Figure 20: Coogee Pier, November 1928 Hood Collection part II: (State Library NSW).



Figure 21: Coogee Pier (Randwick City Council)

November 1929 saw the official opening of a shark net which was attached to one of pier's pylons and extended halfway across the bay. The celebrations coincided with the opening of Giles ocean baths and new surf sheds, and the promoted event "Come to Coogee Week" was marked by a *'mile-long procession before a crowd of 135,000 spectators*'. ¹³

Following World War 1, Coogee experienced substantial growth and the area transitioned from a place of leisure and tourism to a place for permanent residence. The establishment of beach facilities, and construction of local community infrastructure and services, such as the post office and St Brigid's Catholic Church (designed by Albert Edmund Bates and constructed 1921-1922) further facilitated this transition.¹⁴

¹² Randwick City Council

¹³ Randwick Municipal Council (1989) p.89

¹⁴ Oultram, J (2018)

4.3. Historical context of Edgecumbe Estate

The Surveyor General's map of Randwick Waverley and Coogee dated 1856 shows James Hart as the owner of the western portion of the site comprising lots 5 and 6, Section 11, which formed part of the Crown grant originally laid out in 1838. Lots 7 and 8 were owned by 'B.S. Haigh'. Prior to this time, the historical evidence suggests that the land was vacant.



Figure 22: Randwick Waverley & Coogee 1859. Surveyor General's Office, 1859 (NSW State Library). Red outline identifies subject area.





Figure 23: Water and Sewerage Survey Plans c.1890 showing vacant land on the north western corner of Brook and Dudley Streets (Source: Randwick Council)



The land was purchased in 1910 by Mrs Olive Alice Little and sale posters for Edgecumbe Estate indicate that the properties were listed for sale in 1915, the subdivision formed the cul-de-sac 'Edgecumbe Avenue'.¹⁵

¹⁵ NSW Lands Registry Services

The estate included lots 1 to 7 to the east of Edgecumbe Avenue with lots 1 to 6 having dual frontages to Brook Street and Edgecumbe Avenue, and lots 8 to 13 to the west of Edgecumbe Avenue having an east west orientation and frontages to Edgecumbe Avenue. Lot 13 also comprised a southern side boundary to Dudley Street.

The properties located along Brook Street formed as part of the subdivision Auction in 1915. The remaining lots formed part of a second auction for the Edgecumbe Estate in 1920 (refer to Figure 1926). The auction poster shows that No.144 Brook Street (former 'Minmi Flats') and No.152 Brook Street ('Brooklyn Flats') existed at the time, and that five of the six lots fronting Brook Street had already been sold off.



Figure 25: Edgecumbe Estate Subdivision Auction Sale Plan showing Edgecumbe Avenue, and subject land around to be auctioned, 4th December 1915. (Source: NSW State Library).



Figure 26: Edgecumbe Estate Subdivision Auction Sale Plan showing Edgecumbe Avenue, and subject land around to be auctioned, 24 April 1920. Properties fronting Brook Street (shaded) and indicated as already sold. *Brooklyn Flats* and *Minmi Flats* are existing buildings. (Source: NSW State Library).

The following historical aerial view of Brook Street looking south c.1920 also shows both of these buildings, as well as the vacant undeveloped land located between them. No.142A Brook Street was only partially constructed at the time of this photograph.



Figure 27: View of Brook Street looking south c.1920 (Source: Randwick City Council)

Land titles records indicate that lots 12 and 13 were purchased by James Menary (builder) and David Menary (former policeman) on 3 September 1920. These lots were further subdivided in 1921 into three separate lots (A, B and C) and were reorientated to a north south direction with primary frontages to Dudley Street.¹⁶



Figure 28: Plan (3095-90) showing orientation of Lots A, B and C of DP301192 created in 1921 (NSW Historical Lands Viewer)

¹⁶ Randwick City Council

The occupants of nos. 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street first appear in the Sands Directory between 1922 and 1923. The existing street numbering along this portion of Brook Street was not finalised within the Sands Directory until 1927. Prior to this time, the subject properties were identified by either their building names, their occupants, or a slightly different street number (i.e. Nos.148 and 150 Brook Street were previously identified as nos.150 and 152 Brook Street until 1927).

The historical aerial photograph (Figure 29) shows that by 1930, almost all the buildings within the subject area had been constructed. No.146 Brook Street was subdivided in 1954 in a north/south direction to create a new lot for No.5 Edgecumbe Avenue following the construction of the two storey residential flat building 'Roberta Flats' at the rear of No.146 Brook Street, in 1935.



Figure 29: Aeial view of subject properties c.1930 (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 30: Subdivision Plan of 146 Brook Street 1954. (Randwick City Council)

5. Existing character: Physical attributes and values, curtilage, setting and views and historical themes

5.1. Physical attributes and values

The subject area is characterised by a fine quality grouping of Inter-war period residential accommodation which represent the rapid residential development of Coogee following the First World War. The area comprises an elegant cohort of varying and predominantly intact, residential dwelling types which were built in response to Coogee's growth as a residential suburb during the Inter-war period.

The Inter-war bungalows at 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street were all constructed circa 1921-22 and share a number of similar architectural features including face brick construction, battened gables, exposed rafter ends, asymmetrical front elevations with a verandah and projecting room, and timber framed bay windows with casement sashes. They have aligned setbacks to Dudley Street, and No.41 also addresses Edgecumbe Avenue to the east, with its stone boundary fence and detailing to the side façade. The dwellings also demonstrate construction techniques and materials, including gabled and hipped roofs, the use of reinforced concrete, terrazzo finishes and dark toned bricks.¹⁷



Figure 31: View of 37, 39 and 41 Dudley Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

Although there have been extensive modifications to No.37 Dudley Street (including the construction of a first-floor addition at the rear), the dwelling's original form and scale may still be interpreted from its primary frontage and forms a positive visual relationship with nos.39 and 41. Nos. 39 and 41 Dudley Street are also recognised individually for their historical, aesthetic and representative significance being listed local heritage items pursuant to the Randwick LEP, being substantially intact examples of Inter-war Californian Bungalows. They comprise original external architectural elements and have retained their original integrity through their internal layout and extensive collection of internal original decorative elements.

Similarly, all the buildings fronting Brook Street, with the exception of No.146 were constructed between 1919 and 1925. They comprise a mix of residential accommodation ranging from elevated and grander styled single storey Californian bungalows at nos.148 and 150 (No.148 is a local heritage item), a two-storey residential flat building (No.144) and a duplex (No.146). The row of buildings is bookended by locally listed, decorative three storey residential flat buildings to the north and south (Nos.142A and 152 respectively).

¹⁷ Rosen, S. 2019

The properties still present their original scale and form to Brook Street and follow their original pattern of subdivision mapped by the auction of Edgecumbe Estate. While there was some later division of land to No.146 (c.1954 to create 5 Edgecumbe Avenue), and other modifications to buildings Nos. 144, 146 and 150 Brook Street, the dwellings are largely intact, with three of the buildings (Nos.142A, 148 and 152) already listed within the Randwick LEP, and noted for their historical, aesthetic and representative significance.

Nos.148 and 150 Brook Street are Californian bungalows constructed c.1925. Both dwellings reside on elevated sites, detached and constructed of face brick with sandstone bases and front fences. They comprised gabled and hipped tiled roof forms with timber batons and brick and sandstone decorative front verandahs. Both properties have rear frontages to Edgecumbe Avenue with single storey brick and tiled roof garages. While later additions were undertaken to the rear of No.150, the dwellings visually complement each other when viewed from Brook Street, and contribute positively to the Inter-war character of the streetscape as well as to the immediate setting of No.152 Brook Street.



Figure 32: View of 148 and 150 Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

Nos.144 (c.1920) and 146 (c.1927) are two storey residential buildings.

No.144 comprises two buildings. Fronting Brook Street is two storeys walk up with four apartments (two at ground level and two above). To the rear of No.144 fronting Edgecumbe Avenue is a two-storey duplex building (c.1920s) which also forms part of the site and comprises two units.

Prior to 1961 the building fronting Brook Street comprised only three units with separate entrances from Brook Street frontage. The building underwent a number of modifications to facilitate its conversion to four flats including the removal/reorientation of the front steps, and later infilling of the front verandah openings with the installation of aluminium windows.

However, the building continues to retain its overall original scale and form including its partly shingled gambrel roof. It has also retained the central terrazzo and tiled stairs which lead to the first floor, and despite some contemporary upgrades, all the units have substantially retained their internal layouts. Units 2 and 4 have also retained many of their original internal decorative features.

The building at the rear of the site comprises a hipped roof form at the rear fronts Edgecombe Avenue (also known as 1-3 Edgecumbe Avenue) is simple in its form, scale and design and is

included within the boundary of the proposed conservation area. While its precise construction date is unclear, Council's historical aerial photographs show that the building at the rear was constructed by 1930, and strata subdivision for the total of 6 units was approved in 1969.

Council's historical building records indicate that the two-storey duplex at No.146 Brook Street was constructed around 1927/28. It comprises liver brick construction, battened gabled roof and hipped roof form with pronounced front balconies and painted stone collonettes. The building retains its original decorative elements to the front façade including entrance doors, and French doors to the verandahs with some original leadlight details. Although the apartments have been modified with contemporary internal updates, a substantial amount of decorative fabric has also been retained. Modifications to the building were carried out in 1989 which included installation of a garage at lower ground level.



Figure 33: Nos. 144 and 146 Brook Street as viewed from the opposite side of the road (Source: Randwick City Council)

Council's records indicate that in a similar manner to No.144 Brook Street, the land at the rear of the site was further maximised, and a two-storey Art Deco residential flat building was constructed in 1935 with a frontage to Edgecumbe Avenue ('Roberta Flats'). The building comprises rendered brick construction, hipped and tiled roof form, a symmetrical façade with a grand and geometric central entrance and protruding bay windows at both the ground and first floors. The land was subdivided in to two lots in 1954, and the rear building became known as No.5 Edgecumbe Avenue.

Nos.142A and 152 Brook Street are three storey residential apartment buildings in the 'Inter-war Free Classical'¹⁸ styles with 'stripped classical embellishments'¹⁹ constructed c.1919/1920 and significantly intact and in good condition.

No.142A sits at the northern tip of the subject area and comprises 6 apartments. It has liver brick construction with a symmetrical façade, central entrance and protruding curved bays with decorative leadlight casement windows and original decorative glazed and timber panelled front entrance doors. Internally, the majority of apartments comprise their original layouts and decorative elements including timber skirtings, picture rails, architraves, and fretwork. The

¹⁸ Applerly, R, et al. 1989

¹⁹ Heritage NSW

building contributes significantly to the streetscape and is already recognised for its aesthetic and historical significance.

Similarly, No.152 Brook Street is a three-storey residential flat building with parapet situated on an elevated corner site setback from an original sandstone fenced frontage which forms an extension to the base of the building and its frontage. The building is roughcast rendered and painted on all sides and comprises original geometric decorative openings and retains a large proportion of original timber framed multipaned lead light windows below decorative string courses at each level. The front corners comprise brickwork pattern and attenuated pilasters although the arched and rectangular verandah openings on the front elevation have been infilled with later aluminium framed glazing. A semi-circular portico element projects from the front façade at ground level.

Being located at the corner, the building is highly visible from further south along Brook Street and east along Dudley Street and it presents a significant aesthetic contribution to the character and appearance of both the Brook and Dudley Street streetscapes.





Figure 34: View of 142A Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

Figure 35: View of 152 Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

Though varying in their styles of Inter-war architecture and dwelling types, the collection of buildings fronting Dudley Street and Brook Street, together with the associated buildings fronting Edgecumbe Avenue follow their original subdivision pattern of the Edgecumbe Estate. They have all retained their original forms including roof styles and setbacks as well as their low to medium density scales. Collectively, they retain an extensive number of surviving decorative features which were commonly deployed in the early 1920s, and together the dwellings unmistakably represent a key period of construction in the early development of Coogee²⁰.

The table below provides a summary of key values or characteristics of the proposed heritage conservation area.

Table 2: Existing character values

Subdivision	Lots are consistent in depth and width as per their original subdivision pattern following sale of Edgecumbe Estate.
Landscape and public domain elements	Streetscapes have strong landscape quality with mature plantings, some elevated frontages to Brook Street.

²⁰ Rosen, S .2019

Scale and form	Combination of single storey detached dwellings and two to three storey residential flat buildings.
Siting and setbacks	Consistent setbacks along Dudley Street with varying but cohesive setbacks to Brook Street.
Roof forms	Traditional hipped and gabled roof forms for detached dwellings and duplex, flat roofs (with or without parapet) or gambrel roof for residential flat buildings.
Materials and detailing	Face brick, smooth faced red or liver bricks often with stone footings and stone trim elements, painted brick or roughcast rendered walls.
	Decorative brickwork detailing to principal facades. Timber shingles, decorative leadlight windows.
Car parking	Accessed from secondary frontages Edgecumbe Avenue with some later addition parking structures to dwellings on Dudley Street and Brook Street.
Fences	Combination of original brick or stone boundary fences with some later infill along the eastern side of Edgecumbe Avenue.

5.2. Curtilage and setting

5.3. Curtilage

The curtilage of the subject area follows the original remaining lots of the Edgecumbe Estate parcel of land prior to its subdivisions and sales in 1915 and 1919. The proposed area is physically bounded by existing roadway infrastructure to the north, east and south, and bounded to the west and north west by later twentieth century development. North of the subject area lies the overpass where Havelock Street Avenue runs below Brook Street in a north west/south easterly direction. Brook Street bounds the area to the east, and Dudley Street bounds the area to the south.

Immediately north west of the proposed area is a later twentieth century three storey brick residential complex containing 33 units and constructed in 1984. The development occupies the north western portion of the original Edgecumbe Estate land parcel and is excluded from the proposed conservation area. Immediately west of the proposed area is the aged care facility 'Our Lady's Nurses of the Poor'.

Included within the curtilage of the proposed area are the grassed and landscaped verges along Brook and Dudley street frontages and the eastern side of Edgecumbe Avenue, as well as a small portion of the grassed verge on the western side of Edgecumbe Avenue adjacent to No.41 Dudley Street. Mature trees including Canary Island Date Palms, Coastal Banksias and Broad Leaf Paperbarks line the verges along Edgecumbe Avenue, Dudley and Brook streets.



Figure 36: Nos. 144 and 146 Brook Street as viewed from the opposite side of the road (Source: Randwick City Council)





Figure 37: Mature Broad Leaf Paperbarks along Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

Figure 38: Pedestrian reserve between Nos. 142A and 144 Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

The pedestrian path reserve (142R) between No.142A and 144 Brook Street is also included within the area's curtilage, along with the southern portion of the Edgecumbe Avenue roadway between No.41 Dudley Street and the rear of 152 Brook Street.

5.4. Setting and views

As described within Section 2.1.2 of this report, the subject area sits within a wider residential context characterised by a mix of residential dwelling types including those with historical Federation and Inter-war character interspersed with both mid-late twentieth century and later contemporary infill towards the east, and to the south along Dudley Street.

Within the wider setting of the proposed conservation area is also 'St Brigid's Catholic Church' (Heritage Item I70 within Randwick LEP 2012) located at 135B Brook Street and located to the north east of the area on the opposite side of Brook Street. The church shares a visual relationship with the subject area as views to the church are appreciated from the northern portion of the area, and vice versa.

Views of the area are also experienced from the opposite side of Dudley Street further to the west, and from further south along Brook Street where the proposed conservation area can also be appreciated within the context of St Brigid's Church.



Figure 39: Brook Street looking north from Dudley Street with No.152 in foreground and St Brigid's further north. (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 40: Looking north east from the southern side of Dudley Street showing nos.37, 39 and 41 in foreground and rear of No.152 Brook Street to the east (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 41: Looking north west towards the subject area from the intersection of Dudley Street and Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)



Figure 42: Looking south west towards the subject area from St Brigid's Church on the opposite side of Brook Street (Source: Randwick City Council)

5.5. Historical Themes

The following historical themes, as identified within this report, are illustrated within the proposed heritage conservation area.

Theme	Notes ²¹	Comments
Transport	Activities associated with the moving of people and goods from one place to another, and systems for the provision of such movements'	The increased accessibility of Coogee by the introduction of the tram extension from Randwick in 1883 facilitated the transition of Coogee from a place of tourism and leisure to a permanent place of residence. The subdivision of Edgecumbe Estate and residential development ensued.
Towns, suburbs and villages <i>(Suburbanisation)</i>	Activities associated with creating, planning and managing urban functions, landscapes and lifestyles in towns, suburbs and villages	Although original plans for the 'Village of Coogee' were established in the 1820s, Coogee's residential development advance didn't truly advance until the extension of the tram from Randwick in 1883. The subdivision layout of Edgecumbe Estate was influenced by the original grid pattern of streets, and the subsequent development of its lots for residential uses was further propelled following the establishment of the local school and post office, as well as the permanent beach facilities such as the shark net, baths and surf lifesaving club.
Accommodation	Activities associated with the provision of accommodation, and particular types of accommodation'	The majority of the buildings within the proposed Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area were constructed between 1919 and 1925, with some later infill addition at constructed 1927 and 1935.

Table 3: Historical themes

²¹ Heritage NSW (Historical Themes)

		The subject area comprises a fine grouping of Inter- war residential accommodation styles including modest and grand Californian Bungalows and Art Deco and Free Classical. Their styles and types of accommodation reflect the aspirations of the varying social classes at the time and are able to demonstrate the rapid development of Coogee following World War One.
Leisure	Activities associated with recreation and relaxation'	Coogee had been promoted as a place of leisure during the nineteenth century, facilitated by the construction of the Coogee Aquarium and Baths in 1887 and the establishment of the Surf Life Saving Club and Wylie's Baths in 1907. By the early twentieth century Coogee was transitioning to a more permanent place of residence, aided by the construction of the Coogee Pier in 1928, installation of the shark net and Giles Baths in 1929 and the local school and postal services.
		Edgecumbe Estate subdivision and its development for the range of residential types were able to cater for various permanent residents desiring to benefit from the leisured lifestyle.

6. Assessment of Significance

6.1. Assessment against Heritage Council of NSW criteria

The following table provides an assessment of the Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area against the seven criteria outlined within the guidelines for assessing heritage significance prepared by Heritage Council of NSW.²²

Criteria	Assessment
Criterion (a) Historical Significance An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or	Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area has historical significance due to its compact grouping of fine quality yet varying types of residential accommodation which all date from the Edgecumbe Estate subdivision auctions in 1915 and 1920, when the area was first subject to residential subdivision. ²³
natural history of the local area);	The area's intact combination of Inter-war styles of architecture including both grand and modest detached Californian Bungalows, Free Classical style and Art Deco residential flat buildings collectively demonstrate Coogee's suburbanisation and residential needs during the early twentieth century and is evidence of the growth of the residential suburb and its transition from a place of simply tourism and leisure. Fuelled by the provision of the Randwick to Coogee tramline extension in 1883 and the attractive beach lifestyle of Coogee, the buildings within the Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area are also able to demonstrate the

²² NSW Heritage Office. 2001

²³ Rosen, S. 2019

	aspirations of the varying social classes of their original occupants, and continue to be used for their traditional residential uses. Edgecumbe Estate meets the requirements for historical significance.
Criterion (b) Associative Significance An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area);	Historical records and information indicate that there are no known associations for the Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area with a person or group of persons, or important event since its subdivision and development. The conservation area does not meet this criterion.
Criterion (c) Aesthetic Significance An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area);	Edgecumbe Estate is noted for its consolidated grouping of fine quality of Inter-war residential accommodation in varying styles. Sub-groupings of buildings within the conservation area share notable physical characteristics and visually complement both their immediate settings, as well as provide a significant contribution to the character of the Brook Street and Dudley Street streetscapes. The three modest, yet substantially intact Californian bungalows along Dudley Street (nos.37-41) and their hipped and gabled roof forms, timber framed windows and brick construction, together with the two more grander style bungalows along Brook Street (nos.148 and 150), their shared setbacks and elevated presentation to the street, as well as their use of stone within the construction provide fine examples of detached single residences.
	The heritage listed and highly decorative Free Classical styled residential flat buildings anchor the northern and southern ends of the Brook Street frontage, interspersed with the two storey residential flat building and duplex (at nos.144 and 146 Brook Street and 5 Edgecumbe Avenue) and retain their original scale, form and character, and remain considerably interpretable. The original masonry (sandstone and brick) front fences have been retained along the Brook and Dudley Street frontages, and the mature street trees (Saw Toothed Banksia, Coastal Banksias and Broad Leaf Paperbarks) along the verges contribute visual amenity to the area and are evidence of the support for the planned suburbanisation. The proposed area meets the requirements for aesthetic significance.
Criterion (d) Social Significance An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons;	Edgecumbe Estate has some social significance being able to demonstrate the aspirations of the varying historical social classes of its original occupants. The area continues in its traditional residential use and its physical qualities are appreciated by its residents.
Criterion (e) Technical/Research Significance An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the	Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area comprises the original buildings constructed following the subdivisions of 1915 and 1920. While some modifications have incurred, collectively, the buildings are fine examples of varying Inter-war residential styles of accommodation and retain many of their original elements and decorative features. The area does not however demonstrate any particularly unique construction techniques or comprise any rare materials other than those

umbe Estate Conservation Area is an area characterised by its idated grouping of fine quality Inter-war residential modation of varying architectural styles and types. gh the group is not the only example within the City of Randwick a cluster of residential development that demonstrates a particular of construction; it does provide one of the few surviving and t examples of the rapid residential development of Coogee during ty twentieth century.
umbe Estate Conservation Area is significant as it is able to ent the suburbanisation of Coogee as well as the varying ntial needs during a key period of its development in the early eth century. bject area comprises a well preserved fine grouping of Inter-War ntial accommodation ranging from detached grand and modest Californian Bungalows, to two and three storey residential flat gs in Art Deco and Free Classical styles, and through their scale, architectural detailing are able to provide evidence of the varying aspirations of the their occupants. ing of the buildings within the subject area largely follow their I subdivision pattern and are visually appreciated from within their setting. The area is also contained within a curtilage defined by the

6.2. Statement of Significance

Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area has historical, aesthetic and representative significance. It is able to demonstrate Coogee's suburbanisation and residential needs during the early twentieth century when it transitioned from a place of tourism and leisure to a permanent place of residence, which was fuelled by the provision of the Randwick to Coogee tramline extension in 1883, as well as the promotion of its attractive beach lifestyle and development of supporting local facilities.

The area comprises a consolidated grouping of fine quality Inter-war residential accommodation in varying styles including modest and grand Californian Bungalows, Free Classical and Art Deco residential flat buildings and sited on lots which largely follow their subdivision pattern of 1915 and 1920. They comprise notable and shared physical characteristics between sub-groups of buildings, and their visual quality complement both their immediate settings, and also provide a significant contribution to the character of the Brook and Dudley streetscapes. Their aesthetic contribution is further supported by the individual listings of five out of the ten properties (Nos.39 and 41 Dudley Street, and 142A, 148 and 152 Brook Street) within the conservation area.

Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area has some social significance being able to demonstrate the aspirations of the varying social classes of their original occupants, and the buildings continue to be used for their traditional residential uses.

7. Comparative analysis

There are three (3) comparable heritage conservation areas listed within Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP 2012 which demonstrate similar characteristics and values to Edgecumbe Estate due to their fine quality groupings or examples of a period of construction, their consolidated areas, and/or their historical subdivision patterns. These are the 'Dudley Street Heritage Conservation Area' (C9), 'Moira Crescent Heritage Conservation Area' (C11) and 'Caerleon Crescent Heritage Conservation Area' (C20).²⁴

The location, statement of significance and character values of these conservation areas as outlined within the Randwick Development Control Plan (DCP) are provided within the table below:





Dudley Street Heritage Conservation Area (C9)

Statement of Significance

The heritage conservation area includes fine quality groupings and individual examples of large Federation and Inter-War period detached houses. Several styles are represented, including Federation Bungalow and Queen Anne and Inter-War Mediterranean and Functionalist. The most outstanding individual examples are the Federation Queen Anne style houses at Nos 16, 22, 34 and 36 Dudley Street and Nos 1 and 7 Thomas Street. Their large and bowed windows take maximum advantage of views. The houses are situated on elevated sites, with views of the Pacific Ocean to the east and north over the adjacent Baker and Leete Parks. The front gardens, fence designs, sandstone kerbing, steep and undulating topography, and the palm, pine and fig tree plantings in the parks, all contribute to the aesthetic quality of the setting.

The existing houses demonstrate the process of development of the area in the first few decades of the twentieth century. The social class and aspirations of the original occupants are demonstrated by the design of these large houses, on desirable sites with ocean views.

²⁴ Randwick LEP 2012

²⁵ Randwick DCP 2013

The heritage conservation area has social significance because its physical qualities are appreciated by its residents and the general community. The heritage conservation area continues in its traditional residential use.

Character values

Landscape and public domain elements	Front gardens, steep and undulating topography, and palm, pine and fig tree plantings in the parks contribute to the aesthetic quality of the setting
Scale & Form	Large detached houses, single storey and two storey.
Siting & Setbacks	Houses generally well set back from and elevated above street
Roofs	Traditional pitched roofs, includes a number of steeply pitched gabled roofs.
Materials	Walls predominantly face brickwork, some stucco. Terracotta tiles and slate roofing.
Detailing	Predominantly timber decoration to verandahs, gables etc.
Verandahs & Balconies	Front verandahs integral to each of the architectural styles which are represented in the area.



Statement of Significance

The heritage conservation area has aesthetic significance because of the high integrity of its Inter-War streetscapes. Most buildings are constructed of red or liver coloured face brickwork, which is complemented by the red terracotta tile roofs. The most common building types are detached single storey Inter-War Bungalows and two or three storey flat buildings in Functionalist, Spanish Mission, Art Deco, Stripped or Free Classical or Bungalow inspired styles. The area includes the best preserved and most consistent grouping of Inter-War flat buildings in the City of Randwick, which were so characteristic of the City's development in that period. Most properties have dwarf piered face brick boundary fences which allow the gardens in front of the

buildings to become part of the streetscape. The landscape quality of the streetscapes is also enhanced by the curved streets and wide nature strips. Some steeper sites have sandstone walling. The precinct of Inter-War period housing has a close spatial connection to the small commercial centre on Clovelly Road. Most of the shops are two storeys and date from the Inter-War period.

The existing buildings, lot and street pattern demonstrate the process of the rapid subdivision and development of this part of the Randwick City area in the Inter-War period. This development followed the opening of the Clovelly tram line earlier in the century. The heritage conservation area is a well-preserved example of an entire Inter-War period neighbourhood. The design of the buildings and the range of types are representative of the lifestyles and economic conditions which were current in the Inter-War period.

The heritage conservation area has social significance because its physical qualities are appreciated by its residents. The area continues in its traditional residential and commercial use.

Character values

Subdivision	Curved streets and wide nature strips.	
Landscape and public domain elements	Streetscapes have a strong landscape quality.	
Scale & Form	Consistency of scale, generally two and three storeys.	
Siting & Setbacks	Main rooms and balconies of individual apartments oriented to the street.	
Roofs	Includes both traditional hipped roofs and fla roofs with parapets.	
Materials	Walls of red or liver coloured face brickwork. Red terracotta tiles.	
Detailing	Decorative elements in stone, brickwork and cement render.	
Verandahs & Balconies	Recessed balconies a design feature of the front elevation.	
Garages, carports, carspaces & driveways	Garages often incorporated to the rear of buildings.	
Fences	Dwarf pierced face brick front boundary fences allow front gardens to become part of the streetscape.	
Gardens & garden elements	Private rear garden accessed by back stairs	

Caerleon Crescent Heritage Conservation Area



Statement of Significance

Caerleon Crescent, which is not crescent-shaped, was an early twentieth century construct. It belonged to a block of land owned by the Moore family and fronting onto Frenchmans Road. Caerleon Crescent is a thoughtfully planned street with a wide, planted median strip and a passage linking it to Frenchmans Road. Caerleon Crescent also has aesthetic significance as an intimate, contained precinct where the original buildings from the turn of the nineteenth century remain largely intact. The street trees contribute to the aesthetic values of the precinct.

Key area values

- Historical value as a substantially intact example of subdivision in Randwick City at the turn of the nineteenth century.
- Central planted median provides focus for the precinct.
- Pedestrian passageway to Frenchmans Road.
- Intimately scaled, contained precinct.
- Contributory street tree planting.
- Consistency of single storey scale and semi-detached form of the contributory buildings.
- Consistency of roofscape. Federation Queen Anne style, featuring face brickwork, hipped and gabled roofs in terracotta tiles and timber trim.
- Some original early front fences.
- Consistent narrow setback from street boundary.

8. Conclusion

As outlined within this report, the proposed Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area has historical, aesthetic and representative significance for the City of Randwick and can demonstrate the pattern of historical subdivision of Coogee and its response to the varying residential needs during the early twentieth century.

The proposed conservation area is recognised aesthetically for its consolidated grouping of well preserved and fine quality Inter-war residential accommodation in varying styles ranging from

detached grand and modest styled Californian Bungalows, to two and three storey residential flat buildings in Art Deco and Free Classical styles. The shared physical characteristics within their sub-groups and visual qualities complement their immediate setting, provide significant streetscape amenity, and are able to be appreciated from their wider context. The area's historical significance is further advocated by the existence of five (out of ten) locally listed heritage items Schedule 5 of the Randwick LEP, within the area's curtilage.

There are only a limited number of existing conservation areas within the City of Randwick which share similar characteristics and values. Edgecumbe Estate Conservation Area has the capacity to demonstrate themes of accommodation, suburbanisation, transportation and leisure and is able to contribute positively to the historical value and character of the suburb of Coogee and the Randwick local government area.

9. References

Apperly, Richard et al. 1989 'A pictorial guide to identifying Australian Architecture', Angus & Roberson Publishers

Heritage Council of NSW: 'Assessing Historical Importance: A Guide to State Heritage Register Criterion A,' 2006 Heritage Council of NSW: Assessing Heritage Significance

Heritage Council NSW: 'New South Wales Historical Themes', 2001

Heritage Council of NSW: https://apps.environment.nsw.gov.au/dpcheritageapp/ViewHeritageItemDetails

Lawrence, J. 2001. 'Pictorial History: Randwick', Kingsclear Books

Museum of Applied Arts and Science: Glass plate negative, full plate, 'Coogee Bay, Sydney', Henry King, Sydney, Australia, c. 1880-1900

National Library of Australia, Australian Red Cross Society. New South Wales Division. 1914, *The N.S.W. Red Cross record* The Division, Sydney viewed 20 May 2021

National Library of Australia, Higinbotham, Robinson & Harrison. 1886, *Randwick, Parishes of Alexandria and Botany* Published by Higinbotham, Robinson & Harrison, draughtsmen, lithographers & map publishers, Sydney viewed 13 May 2021

NSW Historical Lands Viewer, https://hlrv.nswlrs.com.au/

Oultram, J, 2018 '39 Dudley Street, Coogee: Heritage Assessment' John Oultram Heritage & Design

Randwick City Council. 2019. 'Coogee and the Bidjigal and Gadigal People'

(https://www.randwick.nsw.gov.au/about-council/news/news-items/2019/may/coogee-and-the-bidjigal-and-gadigal-people)

Randwick City Council. Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012

Randwick City Council. Randwick Development Control Plan 2013

Randwick Municipal Council. 1989. 'Randwick: A Social History' New South Wales University Press

Rosen, S. 2019 'Heritage Study of Properties on cnr Brook Street and Dudley Street Coogee: Peer Review'. Sue Rosen Associates.

Sands Postal Directory [CN-0002]. City of Sydney Archives,

https://archives.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/nodes/view/495003

State Library NSW, Randwick Waverley & Coogee 1859 [Cartographic Material]. Surveyor General's Office, 1859.

State Library NSW, Rolleston, C. H., and Coogee Advancement League. Beautiful Coogee / Compiled and Edited by C.H. Rolleston. Coogee Advancement League, 1929.

State Library NSW, Coogee Pier, November 1928 Hood Collection part II: [City streets and scenes: including streetscapes, labour processions, military parades and memorials, statues and Cenotaph]

The Burra charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, Australia ICOMOS Incorporated

Randwick City Council 30 Frances Street Randwick NSW 2031 1300 722 542 council@randwick.nsw.gov.au www.randwick.nsw.gov.au

